

Stark Area Regional Transit Authority Board Of Trustees Meeting

October 25, 2006 @ 6:00 PM
SARTA – Board Room, 1st Floor

I. Call To Order

Charles DeGraff, Board President convened the meeting at 6:03 PM.

II. Attendance (Quorum was present)

Charles DeGraff, President; Nancy Johnson, Vice-President; Phyllis Beyers; Amanda Fletcher; Chet Warren; Fred Moore; William Rudner; Gerald Bixler

Excused

Randy Bond

Staff

Charles Odingbe, Executive Director/CEO; Glenna Caruso, Project Manager; Kelly Zachary, Human Resource Administrator; Carole Kuczynski, Finance & Administration Director; Jack Thompson, Customer Service Manager; Jerry Shilling, Operations Director; Richard Kyle, Marketing & Customer Service Specialist; Kelly Huston, Finance; Tammy Marie Chavers, Executive Assistant

Legal Counsel

Atty. Gust Callas, Black McCuskey

Other

Joel Reott, Jeffrey Carr Construction; Karl Lucas, SCATS (Stark County Area Transportation Study); Lindsay Menapace, WHBC; Robert Wang, Repository

III. Award Presentation

Mr. Odingbe reported that he picked up the “2006 Outstanding Public Transit System” award, along with Glenna Caruso and Jerry Shilling. Each Board member and staff member will receive an APTA pin in recognition of this award. He also noted that this is something to be proud of and that SARTA promises to work even harder to raise the bar in terms of efficiency and effectiveness. Also to show appreciation to the Board, they will receive the new SARTA shirt to wear with pride. Mr. Odingbe also informed everyone that there is a picture on the website of the presentation of this award.

Charles DeGraff announced on behalf of the Board, this award was the result of the entire staff doing their job. Thank you and you are very deserving of it.

IV. Approval of Minutes (Board Meeting on September 27, 2006)

DeGraff asked about the status of the Wooster project. Mr. Odingbe commented that only Ralph Regula's representative showed up. Moreover, the officials at that time decided they want to bring in other businesses for assistance with this project. When they are ready they will let us know what the next move will be.

Mr. Warren moved to approve the minutes. Ms. Fletcher seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

V. Citizens Communications

Joel Reott, from Jeff Carr Construction, questioned the recommendation for the Alliance bid to Alliance Venture. He stated that Carr Construction was the lowest responsible bidder for the general contractor portion. Onyx was the lowest bidder for plumbing & electrical. Hampton was the lowest bidder for heating. There were 5 bid packages for a combined total of \$904,000. Onyx submitted an entire package in the amount of \$933,000, which is the difference of 29,000.

Discussion followed.

VI. Board Committee Reports

A. Finance (William Rudner) No reports

B. Personnel (Phyllis Beyers)

Ms. Beyers passed out an evaluation to all of the Board Members. She asked that they mail them back to her home address. Personnel will get together by e-mail. Mr. DeGraff requested that they be mailed back by November 1, 2006.

C. Capital Project/Public Property (Phyllis Beyers) No reports

D. Citizens Advisory No reports

VII. Departmental Reports

A. Operations (Jerry Shilling) As submitted

Ms. Beyers asked how many buses & drivers are on the road on Sunday. Mr. Shilling answered that there are 8 fixed routes & 2 curb-to-curb, 10 buses total, running from 8:45 until 6:30 PM. Mr. Odingbe added that only one shift operates on Sundays.

Mr. Rudner inquired about the ridership numbers for September with the 45% drop in ridership. Mr. Odingbe responded that staff is still struggling with the new fare boxes. GFI has been invited to

assist staff with this matter. We will provide a report to the Board in November.

Ms. Beyers indicated her concerns about no shows. One day she needed a ride and could not get a ride. She asked if there was a waiting list after someone no shows or cancels. Mr. Odingbe addressed the Board by stating that this is one of the challenges we struggle with. You want to put a policy in place to address no shows. If you review the no show list, some of them are mentally challenged. For example, a woman forgot what day she booked the ride. The bus was there on the day she requested, which was a different day that she remembered.

Mr. DeGraff made mention that there has been a steady drop in no shows since January. Does this figure represent 288 different people or is it multiple repeat offenders? Mr. Shilling stated that no shows are coming down because Proline staff was instructed to call & find out why these customers do not show up for their rides. There is a cancellation policy in place, however we are taking time to call all of them. They have actually moved some people off the list & explained the reason to the customers. It is a low percentage compared to the total number of passengers. You are always going to have some no shows.

Mr. Odingbe stated that we will continue to try to resolve this problem, given the condition of some of the riders.

Mr. Warren asked what are preventable accidents. Mr. Shilling explained that an accident review committee reviews all accidents involving a fixed object and determine if an accident is preventable or non-preventable accidents. Mr. Odingbe followed by saying that all operators are required to report any accidents or incidents on SARTA'S company vehicles.

B. Maintenance

As submitted

Mr. DeGraff complimented Maintenance on the streamlined report. Mr. Odingbe noted that Julie Juszli worked really hard to streamline the report.

C. Finance

Ms. Kuczynski passed out a draft of the budget. She asked the Board to review the draft by the next Work Session in November. She informed the Board that Finance would meet with Mr. Rudner to go over the budget. Any questions, please submit beforehand. You will notice 2 pages that have been added. The 2nd & 3rd

pages are the breakdown by department of the 1st page summary. Ms. Kuczynski requested that the Board take special note because they will begin presenting financial statements from the same simplified format. So Finance would like comments in regards to the readability on that as well. The Board was also asked to keep in mind that this is a draft because Finance is still working on the capital projects local match part of the budget to get those in line with our goal of a balanced budget.

Ms. Kuczynski made it known that SARTA is working with SCATS to develop a Coordinated Transportation Plan that will include all the transportation available in Stark County, and has the aim of eliminating overlap of services within the county. She will send out invitations to all transportation providers (for profit providers, not-for-profit providers, and transit) to form a committee to write the plan. The plan must be developed so that the allocated Section 5307 Federal Transit Grant Funds allocated for New Freedom and JARC funds can be dispersed. Mr. Jaeger of SCATS has recommended to the SCATS policy committee that SARTA be the designated recipient of these funds. The grant approval for these funds will go through a process for selection, which will be outlined in the Coordinated Transportation Plan.

SARTA is in the process of developing security policies and procedures. Security audit results were positive for all the sites. Recommendations were not that extensive.

Mr. Odimgbe stated that there would be a presentation at a future work session. This session will be just for the discussion of budget.

Ms. Beyers asked about the New Freedom provisions. Mr. Odimgbe explained that the New Freedom rules go beyond ADA transit requirements. The President of the United States added the provisions. For example, expanding services to go from door to door versus curb to curb. Money would be awarded to us. We would oversee that anyone with a project is in compliance with FTA requirements.

Mr. DeGraff then asked what are you talking about in terms of dollars that SARTA would receive. Ms. Kuczynski stated that it would be about \$100,000. Ms. Beyers inquired if that would mean more staff. Mr. Odimgbe replied no. We will try to make it happen with existing staff.

Mr. DeGraff requested that the Fair Box Recovery Chart title be renamed to reflect what it actually represents.

D. Customer Service

As submitted

Mr. DeGraff asked what was the title of the bar chart on the first page. Mr. Thompson responded that it was Ticket Sales.

E. EEO/Safety/First Care of SARTA

Next month

F. Human Resources

As submitted

Ms. Beyers inquired if we were shopping around for our Health Care Plan or is there nothing else available. Ms. Zachary informed the Board that she meets with Bob Fisher every year just to check on what is available in the market. There is no one else comparable to Aultcare. Mr. Odingbe added that we are doing the best to bring premiums down.

G. Projects

Ms. Caruso asked the Board to refer to their handouts.

Mr. Rudner asked if the work in progress is because we have not closed out all the contracts with the Gateway Project. Mr. Odingbe answered yes.

H. Labor Management

Next Month

VIII. Communications

Board President

No discussion

Board

No discussion

Executive Director/CEO

Mr. Odingbe informed the Board that SARTA was in the process of reorganizing by combining departments to streamline costs. There are still some challenges that exist. This will be presented later.

Mr. Odingbe stated that the Harmont construction is going well. It should be done by the end of this week. We still need to get permission from Wal-Mart to construct the sidewalk. This project will be done in two phases. The first phase is to complete the curbing and pull off without the sidewalk. The second phase is to install the

sidewalk itself and the shelter. Mr. Odingbe noted that he instructed Mr. Shilling to call Wal-Mart and let them know their patrons will destroy landscaped area. So it is critical to have the sidewalk put in place. Joe Concatto actually made a call to Wal-Mart today on behalf of SARTA, giving them to the end of this week to respond to us. Mr. Odingbe commented that the overall project is coming along really well & finally near completion.

IX. Executive Team Minutes

Mr. DeGraff inquired about the Newsletter that is coming out. He also noted that it would be nice to see that Newsletter in the Board Packet. Mr. Odingbe noted that Richard Kyle was chairing that project.

X. Middle Management Meetings Minutes

Mr. Rudner asked about the date for the 10th anniversary. Glenna informed the Board that there are several dates dedicated to the 10th anniversary. She added that she would supply an agenda.

XI. For Your Information

Ms. Johnson shared that she was happy to hear that the commercials incorporated that SARTA is #1, especially since many people don't know.

XII. Resolutions

A. Expressing Grave Concern Regarding The Current Level Of State Transit Funding And Urging Positive Action To Ensure Appropriate Funding For Ohio Transit Systems

Mr. Moore moved for the adoption of this resolution. Ms. Fletcher seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Johnson inquired about the terminology used in this resolution such as "lame duck". Mr. Odingbe made the Board aware that this resolution was not prepared by SARTA.

B. For Application FY 2007 State Grants "Ohio Elderly & Disabled (E & D) Transit Fare Assistance Program Grant"

Mr. DeGraff asked if this resolution is an Operating or Capital grant. Mr. Odingbe educated that it was an Operating Grant, which is already included in the budget.

Ms. Johnson moved for the adoption of this resolution. Mr. Warren seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

- C. For Application FY 2007 Federal Grants “Section 5307 Federal Grant For Internet Program TEAM”

Mr. Odingbe noted that it should be through Internet and not for.

Mr. Warren moved for the adoption of this resolution. Mr. DeGraff seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

- D. For Application FY 2006 State Grant – 5307 Formula Grant Program (OPTGP) In The Amount of \$249,548

Mr. Odingbe made special emphasis that this resolution is for state funding.

Mr. Warren moved for the adoption of this resolution. Ms. Fletcher seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

- E. A Resolution Authorizing The Executive Director To Surplus Obsolete Fixed Assets

Mr. Rudner moved for the adoption of this resolution. Mr. Bixler seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

- F. A Resolution Authorizing The Executive Director To Enter Into A Contract With Alliance Ventures Inc. For The Sum Of \$933,630 For The Complete Construction Of The Alliance Transit Center

Mr. Warren moved for the adoption of this resolution. Ms. Beyers seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Rudner asked if this job was bonded. Mr. Odingbe answered yes. Mr. Rudner stated that he has been a practicing CPA for 40 years, some of what we heard before was out of line & B.S. If the job is not complete the bonding company will be responsible for it.

Ms. Caruso then confirmed that Jeff Carr Construction did in fact do the job at Cornerstone and that there were problems with that job.

Mr. Rudner suggested that the Board pass the motion & not talk about it.

Mr. Bixler stated that he assumes the committee went over the entire bidding package. Alliance Ventures is responsible for the entire package and that the SARTA staff will not be supervising this job. Then he asked the question if there was anything to lead

Carr Construction to believe they were right in bidding the way they did.

Mr. Odingbe answered there was an option given. It is up to us to decide which is more cost effective for the agency. He went on to inform the Board that when Cornerstone was done, SARTA had to pay Harris Day (HDTB) \$163,000. It creates too much confusion.

Mr. Callas interjected that four contractors bid the entire package. Mr. Bixler added that he appreciates dealing with one contractor versus four for the entire package.

G. A Resolution Authorizing The Stark Area Regional Transit Authority Serve As The Designated Recipient Of The Job Access And Reverse Commute Program (JARC), And New Freedom Grants

Ms. Beyers moved for the adoption of this resolution. Mr. Warren seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Rudner asked what kind of legal responsibility SARTA would be taking on. Mr. Odingbe reported that FTA has audit and oversight for anyone who applies for grant actions. Mr. Rudner questioned what does oversight capabilities mean? Will there be audits involved because that might be something we don't ever want to get into. Do we need to provide an audit team?

Discussion Followed.

Mr. DeGraff asked what do we get out of this. Mr. Odingbe responded that SARTA will receive 10% of the approximately \$100,000 (or 10 or 11 thousand dollars).

Mr. DeGraff asked about us choosing ourselves. Can we apply for those funds if we have oversight? Ms. Kuczynski responded that we would submit applications according to the requirements set up by the committee.

Mr. DeGraff further inquired if the amount of work was worth \$10,000. Ms. Kuczynski informed the Board that the \$10,000 is just for oversight. We already do paperwork as part of our normal business process. It has the same requirements as our normal FTA reporting. Mr. Odingbe added that SARTA would be getting paid to go through this process.

Ms. Byers questioned the timeline to be used. Ms. Kuczynski answered that it is the same as the regular 5307 grant funds.

Ms. Johnson asked if SARTA would be able to help other agencies in the county. Mr. Odingbe answered yes.

- H. A Resolution To Authorize The Executive Director/CEO To Enter Into Contract With Ports Petroleum For The Purchase Of Diesel Fuel For 2007 At A Cost Of \$2.12 Per Gallon For An Estimated 650,000 Gallons

Mr. Warren moved for the adoption of this resolution. Mr. Bixler seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

XIII. Old Business

Mr. Odingbe gave the update that the Trolleys are not doing well. He informed the Board that he does not know how much longer SARTA will be able to sustain the operation.

Mr. Bixler commented that he assumed the Trolleys would be for seasonal use versus year round. If the Trolleys are going to be successful it has to be cheaper.

Mr. DeGraff added that someone would have to cover the \$1 fare.

XIV. New Business

Mr. Rudner thanked SARTA for the get-well card signed by a lot of people. He appreciated the card & it came at a good time.

Adjournment

Mr. Warren moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Bixler seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously. The Board Meeting was adjourned at 7:34 PM.